Preparedness and the review of *Tomorrow’s Doctors*

Professor Michael Farthing  
Chair of the *Tomorrow’s Doctors* Review Group
A typical 17th century ‘medical student’

Who is he?
Was he prepared for practice?
Did he think it was important to be prepared?
Who checked whether he was prepared?
Preregistration house officers’ views

‘Medical school has prepared me well for the jobs I have undertaken so far?’

Goldacre et al, BMJ 2003; 326: 1011
Preregistration house officers’ views

‘Medical school has prepared me well for the jobs I have undertaken so far?’

Cave et al, BMC Med Ed 2007; 7: 38
Preregistration house officers’ views

‘Medical school has prepared me well for the jobs I have undertaken so far?’

Cave et al, BMC Med Ed 2007; 7: 38
Preregistration house officers’ views

Comments:
‘Medical school provided excellent factual preparation for PRHO jobs but was limited in basic problems found on the wards’
‘Not enough emphasis on real life situations’
‘Not enough time shadowing PRHO prior to commencing work’
‘Felt inadequately prepared for surgical house jobs…but you can pick it up very quickly’

Goldacre et al, BMJ 2003; 326: 1011
Analysis

Why are the differences so great between medical schools?
Emphasis on clinical experience?
Tension between short term and long term educational needs and training requirements?
Questions for ‘purchasers’ and ‘providers’?
And the regulator?
The GMC’s purpose

‘to protect, promote and maintain the health and safety of the public by ensuring proper standards in the practice of medicine’
Our four functions

- Education
- Registration
- Fitness to Practise
- Standards for doctors.
The GMC’s role in medical education

- Co-ordinates all stages of medical education (inc. basic medical education in the UK)
- Promotes high standards
- Currently covers undergraduate education and the first year of training after graduation
- Quality assures standards and outcomes: QABME and QAHP
- PMETB to be merged with GMC from 2010.
What is preparedness?

- According to... new graduates? supervising doctors? other staff? patients? evidence eg of prescribing error?
- In order to... start a successful career? be 'fit to practise'? be 'safe'? be 'fit for purpose' in NHS? be ready for FP training under supervision?
- Consisting of... knowledge? and skills? and behaviour?
- Covering... generic width? specialist depth?
Tomorrow’s Doctors (2003)

- Sets **standards** for the knowledge, skills and behaviours undergraduate medical students learn in the UK.
- Provides a **framework** for UK medical schools to use in designing their own curricula/schemes of **assessment**.
- Last reviewed and published in 2003.
Tomorrow’s Doctors – changes since 2003…

- Changes in continuum of medical education and training
- Changes in medicine:
  - Technology
  - Patient demography and expectations
  - Health care systems
GMC preparing for the review

- **Strategic options** for undergraduate medical education – consultation 2005
- Working paper on **curricular outcomes** 2006:
  - Balance between clinical and other skills
  - Whether outcomes should be more specific
  - Leadership and management skills
- Working paper on **curricular delivery** 2006:
  - Quality control at medical schools
  - Curriculum development
  - Placements
  - Doctors as teachers
Tomorrow’s Doctors Review Group

- **GMC/Education Committee**: Professor Michael Farthing, Dr Joan Martin, Professor Debbie Sharp, Mr Rob Slack, Dr John Jenkins
- **Patients/public**: Mr Alan Hartley, Ms Elaine Brock
- **Postgraduate training**: Dr Mike Watson
- **Medical educators/schools**: Professor Tony Weetman, Professor Sam Leinster, Professor Derek Gallen, Dr Ed Neville
- **Students/junior doctors**: Mr Ian Noble, Dr Johann Malawana
- **Educationalist**: Professor Alan Cumming
- **CMO representatives**: Dr Donal O’Donaghue, Professor Michael Harmer, Dr Aileen Keel, Dr Paddy Woods.
Sources for the review

1. QABME reports
2. Research
3. GMC guidance
4. Educational frameworks
5. Engagement
Review sources: issues from QABME

- 2008/9 GMC completing cycle of reviews of all UK medical schools
- Reports published on www.gmc-uk.org
- Issues for Tomorrow’s Doctors include:
  - Assessment
  - Student Selected Components
  - Quality management.
Review sources: external research

- 59% of graduates reported preparedness for practice in 2005 (Goldacre et al., 2007)

- PRHOs felt a big change in responsibilities and anxieties – and skills they had thought irrelevant now looked important (Lempp et al., 2004)

- PRHOs’ confidence at start of induction poor for clinical and practical skills, but significant improvement after extended induction (Evans et al., 2004)
Review sources: GMC-commissioned research

- Professor Janet Grant and Professor Trudie Roberts et al: *An investigation of the explicit and implicit purposes in Tomorrow’s Doctors*
- Dr Jan Illing et al: *How prepared are medical graduates to begin practice?*
- Dr Penny Lewis and Professor Tim Dornan et al: Research under way into prescribing error and its causes.
Review sources: Grant, Roberts et al

- Analysed curricula and QABME reports
- Interviewed students, teachers, FP Trainees, trainees’ supervisors and nurses, and key people at national level

- Found:
  - Scientific basis of medicine not taught and learned adequate to need
  - Problem exacerbated by teaching and learning methods
  - *TD* allows local interpretation and fails to provide sufficient guidance on the necessary core of medical education.
Review sources: GMC guidance

- *Good Medical Practice*, 2006 edition
- *The New Doctor* (with PMETB)
- *Medical students: Professional behaviour and fitness to practise* (with Medical Schools Council)
- *Gateways to the Professions: Advising medical schools: encouraging disabled students* (with DIUS and 11 medical schools).
Review sources: educational frameworks

- Foundation Programme curriculum
- PMETB standards
- *Medical Leadership Competency Framework*
- And many others (referenced in ‘Useful reading’ section of consultation draft)
Review sources: engagement

- **Employers and NHS** – discussions with Dept of Health, NHS Institute for Innovation and Improvement, Assoc of UK University Hospitals, Skills for Health

- **Patients and the public** – workshop, Sept 2008

- **Medical schools and education providers** – discussions with medical schools, Royal Colleges, UK FPO, MMC

- **Medical profession and students** – workshops with students, April and August 2008, meetings with BMA

- **Other agencies** – discussions with regulators for other professions and with Equality and Human Rights Commission.
Tomorrow’s Doctors – proposed structure

- Outcomes for graduates
- Standards for delivery of teaching, learning and assessment.
Overarching outcome

‘To make the care of patients their first concern in accordance with Good Medical Practice, applying their knowledge in a practical and ethical manner and using their ability to provide leadership and to analyse complex and uncertain situations.’
Outcomes for graduates

The new ‘outcomes for graduates’ fall into three categories:

1. The doctor as a scholar and scientist
2. The doctor as a practitioner
3. The doctor as a professional
The doctor as a scholar and scientist

- Apply biomedical scientific principles, method and knowledge
- Apply psychological and social principles, method and knowledge
- Apply population and improvement science principles, method and knowledge
The doctor as a practitioner

- Carry out a consultation with a patient
- Diagnose and manage clinical presentations
- Communicate effectively in a medical context
- Provide immediate care of medical emergencies
- Prescribe drugs safely, effectively and economically
- Carry out practical procedures safely and effectively
- Use information effectively
The doctor as a professional

- Behave according to ethical and legal principles
- Reflect, learn and teach others
- Learn and work effectively within a multi-professional team
- Protect patients and improve care
Standards for delivery of teaching, learning and assessment

- Patient safety
- Quality assurance, review and evaluation
- Equality, diversity and opportunity
- Student selection
- Design and delivery of curriculum including assessment
- Support and development of students, teachers and local faculty
- Management of teaching, learning and assessment
- Educational resources and capacity
- Outcomes
What next

- Consultation mid-December 2008 to late March 2009
- Publication of new edition in summer 2009
- Implementation by 2010/11.